

Suzanne Jamele

Historic Preservation Consulting

1 High Street

Plainfield, Vermont 05667

802-454-7825 phone 802-454-7780 fax scjamele@gmail.com

September 27, 2016

Elizabeth Peebles
Vermont Division for Historic Preservation
National Life North Building
1 National Life Drive, Floor 6
Montpelier, VT 05620

Re: Jeudevine Memorial Library Addition, Hardwick.

Dear Elizabeth:

This letter will provide you with initial information regarding the proposed project to construct an addition providing ADA access to the Jeudevine Memorial Library in Hardwick. Funding sources have not yet been identified but are likely to include state and/or federal sources. At this point, the goal is to get early feedback from you on the general scope of the project and specifically the need to demolish the adjacent building at 81 North Main Street to make room for the proposed addition as well as its proposed design. It is recognized by those planning the project that both buildings are historic resources and that the new addition should be compatible with the library as well as the surrounding historic district.

I have reviewed the above-referenced undertaking in accordance with the standards set forth in 36 CFR 800.4, regulations established by the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation to implement Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. Project review consists of evaluating the project's potential impacts to historic buildings and structures, historic districts, historic landscapes and settings, and known or potential archeological resources.

Historic Resources

Jeudevine Library

The building that houses the Jeudevine Memorial Library, at 93 North Main Street in Hardwick, is a 1 ½ story, red sandstone Richardsonian Romanesque style library built in 1896. It is a contributing structure (#52) in the Downtown Hardwick Village Historic District. The building was designed by Lambert Packard, one of Vermont's most prominent nineteenth-century architects. Packard used Henry Hobson Richardson's Thomas Crane Public Library in Quincy, Massachusetts as his model for designing the Jeudevine. The library was a gift of Malvina Jeudevine who lived across the street wither husband, Alden, a successful local businessman who served in many elected and appointed positions. He had long wanted to do something to benefit his home town and, upon his death in 1888, his wife had the library built.

Setting

The library is located on a small corner lot at the intersection of North Main Street and West

Church Street. The building has a narrow lawn on all sides which is separated from the street on the north and east sides by a public sidewalk. On the south side, the lawn slopes to adjoin the side yard of the house at 81 North Main Street. The small back yard of the library adjoins the side yard of the adjacent property that houses the Episcopal Church. The library is located just uphill from downtown Hardwick which is visible from the front walkway of the building. Across North Main Street is the granite, 2 ½ story, c. 1909, Colonial Revival style Municipal Building. Immediately to the south of the Municipal Building is a large, elaborate, wood frame, c. 1870, French Second Empire/Italianate style house locally known as the Jeudevine Mansion. To the south of the library are two small, c. 1850 gable front vernacular Greek Revival dwellings.

Exterior

The high style library is constructed of rock-faced, coursed – ashlar and tooled red-tinted mortar. A polychrome effect is achieved by the use of a lighter-colored granite for the base of the building, projecting about 3 feet above grade and terminating in a water table marking the first floor and the transition to red sandstone. The asymmetrical building has a broad roof with two eyebrow windows on the front and one on the back roof slopes; and parapets on the gable ends. The north gable end has a large stone chimney with a richly carved flared top that projects slightly from, and bisects, the north end of the building. On the first floor, two 1/1 windows are set to the east of the chimney and there are two small windows flanking the chimney in the gable. There are two basement windows to the east of the chimney and one to the west. All are boarded up.

The front of the building has cross gable with parapet and attached short tower with conical roof. Granite steps lead up to an off-center recessed porch with marble floor under a round arch, from which double doors lead into the building. To the left of the door, the engaged round tower is inset with a band of round-arched windows set under a continuous foliated molding which rises in an arch above each window, giving the molding a scalloped effect. Above is a band of foliated ornament under the fascia. In the front cross gable peak, there is a grouping of three windows under a 3-lobed molding. To the right of the entry, three tall windows with stone mullions and transom bars, have transoms of stained glass. On the left of the front facade, three first floor windows are simply trabeated, while three larger windows on the second floor are separated by squat engaged columns with Romanesque capitals. A carved stone cornice runs across the top of the facade, wrapping around the turret, skipping the gable, and picking up again to the right of it and carrying across to the bottom of the east parapet.

The south side of the building has a ribbon of three small basement windows, three tall windows with carved stone lintels and stained glass transoms, and a small window in the gable.

The back of the building has a ribbon of three boarded up basement windows centered on the rear granite foundation. Centered above them is a ribbon of three tall windows with stained glass transoms. To the left (north) is a ribbon of three tall windows. On the right side (south) of the rear wall is a ribbon of five small windows set under the eaves to light the room which contains the stacks. Below these windows at ground level is a small, gable roofed, wood frame air-lock entry to the basement on a granite base.

Interior

The existing building is tiny with only about 1,125 square feet of finished library space on the main floor. The lower level, another 1,125 square feet, is mostly mechanical, storage space, an on-going used book sale and includes the only bathroom (totally inaccessible). On the interior the building is divided in three sections all with high coffered ceilings, paneled walls and molded trim all executed in golden oak. The front entry opens into a hall running to the back of the building. This space is currently occupied by computer stations. To the right, the north room serves as the children's library, whose focal point is a large fireplace on the north end wall. Stained glass transoms on the front wall richly light the room. The south room contains the stacks which are also constructed of golden oak. At the front of the stack room is an enclosed office area for the librarian with paneled oak half walls topped by glass panels, except the center area which is open. Above the office ceiling is a balcony area also used as an office. It has a golden oak turned balustrade. The balcony and basement are accessed by a steep circular stair, with turned newel posts, enclosed within the turret. The turret's walls are golden oak beadboard on the upper level and brick and stone on the basement level.

81 North Main Street

The c. 1850 vernacular Greek Revival house at 81 North Main Street in Hardwick, is a contributing structure (#53) in the Downtown Hardwick Village Historic District. The building, now vacant, has been used by the Hardwick Senior Center since the 1960s. The house appears on the 1858 Walling map of Hardwick as the home of E. Kellogg and on the 1875 Beers map as the home of Mrs. Fuller. The Sanborn Fire Insurance map for 1898 shows the house with a long wing but no porches and no barn. By 1905 the property had an attached barn at the back of the wing. The property remained the same- house, wing and barn without porches in 1912 and 1922. By 1929 the barn had become an auto garage and the house had a front porch. At the time of the 1939 Sanborn map the property remained the same configuration and the side porch had still not been constructed. The barn is no longer standing.

Historic research has revealed little information regarding the early owners. The 1850 census of Hardwick shows one person with the identification E. Kellogg(g). Erastus Kellogg was a 74 year old farmer who had moved to Hardwick from Massachusetts. He lived in a household that included his son Oren who was also a farmer. By the time of the 1860 census Erastus was no longer listed but Oren was still listed as a farmer. Deed research did not reveal the date of construction or original ownership of the building. Early owners of the property were transferring large pieces back and forth. The chain of ownership reflects the following:

Hardwick Senior Center - December 1969
Harold and Elaine Willey - September 1968
Lenore Hathaway - October 1936
Elijah and Lenora Hathaway - September 1927
Norma and Michael Michaud - June 1920
August and Flora Beals - January 1920
Exzelia and Oscar Michaud - August 1915
C Floss Bliss - September 1913
Carrrie Bridgman - May 1882
Inez and Ida Brabrook - 1871
Elmira Pope

An analysis of the buildings listed on the National Register in the Downtown Hardwick Village Historic District show 21 contributing buildings built between c. 1840 and c. 1860. A map of the historic district with these properties highlighted in orange is attached, along with building descriptions from the National Register nomination and c. 2015 images of the buildings take from Google Streetview. The district retains a solid concentration of buildings dating from the first 60 years of settlement. Nineteen of the identified buildings still stand- two mill buildings (#s 33 and 34) are no longer standing, and another (#66) is substantially altered. The community was organized in 1795 and grew as local industries were established along the Lamoille River which runs through the center of the village. The c. 1840-1860 commercial and residential buildings that still remain stand as a testament to this early period of development. In 1870, a local granite cutting industry began to develop and by the late 1880s was booming. A large concentration of commercial downtown structures, along with areas of new residential buildings constructed in the popular styles of the late 19th century can be found on the outskirts of the village, beyond the central core which developed first. The building at 81 North Main Street is similar to others of the 1840-60 era, being 1 ½ stories with a rear wing, wood frame, sidehall plan, gable front with a molded cornice and returns. Many buildings retain more of their Greek Revival style features than this one does.

Setting

The building is set on a slope of a hill and has a shallow front yard separated from the street by a public sidewalk. The north side yard includes a narrow strip of level lawn and overgrown shrubs and a hill that slopes up to meet the side yard of the Jeudevine Library. There is a narrow strip of lawn on the south side of the building that widens to a larger lawn at the back of the lot. There is no driveway. Immediately to the south is a similar c. 1850 wood frame, gable front, vernacular Greek Revival house with a rear wing. Across North Main Street is the c. 1870 French Second Empire/Italianate style Jeudevine Mansion and the c. 1909 Colonial Revival style Municipal Building.

Exterior

This building is a small, 3x2 bay, gable front, 1 ½ story, vernacular Greek Revival style house. It has a single story, full-façade, shed roof, open front porch covered with a metal roof, supported on half-length turned columns which rest on a shingled porch wall. The right sidehall entrance is simply trimmed in flat casing, as are the windows. Flanking the door are narrow areas of infill clapboards that may once have been sidelights. There is a molded cornice with returns on the front and a molded frieze. The building has a shed dormer to the east with a diamond pane window that lights the second floor hall, and a center chimney. It is sheathed in clapboards and has plain wide corner boards and plain narrow trim around the windows which are 1/1 wood double hung sash with 2/2 wood storm windows. Exterior doors to both porches are natural finish wood glass and panel. A long, 1-story gable roof wing extends to the rear. A 1x7 shed roof enclosed porch with 2/2 wood double hung sash above a shingle half wall, spans the south side of the wing closet to the main block. The portion of the wing that extends to the west beyond the porch is of modern construction. The house has a stone foundation and the wing is set over crawlspaces. The building has a metal roof.

Interior

The main block's first floor contains a stairhall with an early 2th century natural finish railing

with turned balusters and square newel posts, front room and large rear room with a bathroom off the south side. The front room has molded trim around the windows. All other trim in the house is wide plain trim. Doors throughout have six vertical panels and two horizontal panels with ceramic knobs. Most walls and ceilings are plaster although the back first floor room and bathroom in the main block have beadboard ceilings. The second floor of the main block contains three bedrooms under the eaves; all have hardwood floors.

The wing is open between the older and newer parts. A beadboard kitchen cupboard stands along the east wall. The south wall has a door into the side porch. A long narrow horizontal window with two rows of four panes rests to the left of the porch door and a similar window is in the north wall of the older part of the wing. Trim is plain natural finish wood similar to that of the front staircase.

Proposed Project

The proposed project involves construction of an addition to the Jeudevine Library to provide ADA access, code compliance, better restroom facilities and an increase in useable space for this library that currently is using every available inch of space in the building, including the basement. Keeping the library in the current building and constructing an addition is the library Board's preference. If expansion is not possible, moving the library collections and functions to another building that can better serve the library's current and future needs, has been discussed.

Options Considered

Expansion of the library is constrained by its very small lot. Constructing an addition on the back of the building was explored in the past. Given the small size of the lot, the addition would have had to abut the entire back side of the library, thus significantly altering this very special building. The library Board determined that this was not desirable. In addition, the required 15' setback from the adjacent lot of the Episcopal Church, severely restricts what can be built in the library's back yard.

Expanding the library by constructing a connector to the building at 81 North Main Street and renovating that building as additional space was explored. Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing Assessments of the building were conducted by Pearson & Associates in June 2106. All systems need replacing. A structural assessment of the building was prepared on June 20, 2016 by Katherine E. Hill, P.E. of The Structures Studio, PLC-Structural Engineers. The purpose of the report was to assess the feasibility of renovating the building as part of an expansion of the library. The report identified numerous areas where the framing system would need to be repaired or upgraded to meet code, repair deterioration caused by moisture and address movement in the building. Cracks in the plaster in the corners of the second floor bedrooms indicate movement of the building. The building suffers from significant moisture infiltration in the basement and roof and is generally damp and smells of mildew. Black mold is growing between the plaster and wallpaper in the second floor southwest bedroom. Upstairs rooms all have water staining on the walls and ceilings and around the run of the chimney. Mold is growing on the trim and wall around the first floor door to the basement in the back room of the main block.

The building has not been used as a residence for over 50 years and has not been heated for most

of those winters. The building suffers from related deterioration and deferred maintenance. The Hardwick Senior Center has moved out of the building, giving it to the town, due to the high costs associated with repair, upkeep and code compliance.

Converting the building to use as a library would require significant upgrades to the framing to meet the code requirements for library use, given the heavy loads the stacks of books carry. In addition, the small rooms that currently exist in the building would not meet the needs of the library and the floorplan would need to be opened up and reconfigured.

These issues could all be addressed; however, the costs involved in such an upgrade, along with the anticipated on-going costs for repair and maintenance of the building, do not seem to be a reasonable use of town taxpayer dollars, especially considering the space gained will not be suitable for the library's needs. The attached letter from Tom Bachman of Gossens Bachman Architects, dated September 27, 2016, itemizes a number of estimated expenses that would be incurred in order to meet code, HVAC, electrical and structural deficiencies. For these items the repairs/rebuild cost approaches \$250,000. This number does not include insulation, air sealing, finish carpentry, casework, clapboard repair/replacement, painting interior and exterior, roof repair/replacement, chimney repair, rebuilding of windows, etc. It is estimated this additional work could add another \$150,000 if done to commercial standards.

The only feasible way to expand the library and allow it to continue to serve the community, is to demolish the adjacent building at 81 North Main Street and construct an addition to the south of the library. The Library Board recognizes this involves demolition of a building listed on the National Register as contributing structure in the historic district.

Removal of 81 North Main Street

This building is an example of a mid-19th century modest dwelling that was renovated in the early 20th century adding a new Colonial Revival style front porch and interior finishes such as the front staircase and natural finish trim in the kitchen wing. This building, along with the similarly scaled and styled building next door, provide an example of the pre-Civil War residential construction on the outskirts of the commercial core of the community. However, given the building's significant moisture and structural problems, and the importance of continuing to use the Jeudevine as a public library, removal of the building, while adverse, seems reasonable. The loss can be mitigated by documentation of the building and design of a new addition to the library that is compatible with both it and the surrounding historic district.

Design of Proposed Library Addition

Preliminary plans and elevations were prepared by Gossens Bachman Architects and dated August 2016. The proposed addition to the library will be in the 3500 square foot range on two levels and will include a number of community spaces as well as library functions. A single story flat roof, glass and wood connector will join the back of the current Jeudevine building in the area where the small gable roof entry now stands. This will be removed and an entry cut into the rear wall of the library stack room. The rest of the stone wall in this area will remain intact and be exposed in the new connector. The connector will run to a new oval shaped structure at the south end of the hillside adjacent to the library on the lot now occupied by 81 North Main. This will be a pitched roof building, probably a hip roof, constructed of masonry, probably brick, in a

color compatible with the existing library building. Window lintels and the the cornice will be brick and provide visual interest on the exterior. Windows will be vertical and set singly and in clusters. Because the building will be set at the foot of the hill, although it will be two stories it will appear lower in height than the library which will be uphill from the addition. The addition will be set on a slight skew to allow the original Jeudevine building to be visible from a broader vantage point, particularly as one approaches up the hill on North Main Street from the downtown. This setting will allow this significant building to be more fully appreciated. The hillside in front of the new connector will be landscaped with grass steps that can also serve as a seating area, creating a pleasing public gathering space. A small plaza will be at the base of the steps near the sidewalk.

This design makes very minimal changes to the original building and the new addition's form, design and materials are all compatible with both the existing library and the surrounding buildings in the historic district. Placing it at the base of the slope, where the building at 81 North Main now stands, allows the library to gain significant space while keeping the historic building the focal point on this corner of North Main Street. The addition's simple form and design does not detract from the ornate Richardsonian Romanesque library. The addition's quiet simplicity and rounded shape compliment the original library's curvilinear details and its warm, rich interior.

Along with the new addition, work will also include limited upgrades on the interior of the existing library building. These would include refinishing the floors, upgrading the fluorescent lights, converting the steam radiator heating system to hot water and continuing to use the historic radiators, adding a ventilation system and a sprinkler system in the attic. These items will be completed in a manner that minimizes any impact to the significant oak interior finishes.

Preliminary Assessment of Effect

The area of Potential Effect (APE) for this project includes direct effects to the house at 81 North Main Street and the Jeudevine Memorial Library at 93 North Main Street in Hardwick. The APE for indirect effects includes the Downtown Hardwick Village Historic District.

The ability of the Jeudevine Library to continue to serve its original function as Hardwick's public library, as well as its architectural contribution to the community and its association with the Jeudevine family that long played an important role in the community, as well as the building's contribution to the cultural and social life of the community are significant. Construction of a compatible addition designed to be of equal quality to the original library building will complement both the library as well as the surrounding neighborhood that includes the Colonial Revival style Municipal Building and the French Second Empire/Italianate style Jeudevine Mansion. The new addition will add to the qualities that make this area a focal point to the north of the downtown commercial district.

The structure will solve accessibility needs of the library and provide much needed space. The scale, massing, materials, and details of the proposed connector and addition are likely to meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards* for the design of additions to historic buildings. The footprint of the connector and addition breaks up the massing so it does not overwhelm the